

## Executive Summary

### **What impact has the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacy and Numeracy education in Scotland?**

#### Introduction

This research project was performed in part-fulfilment of the degree of Master of Science: Teaching Adults at the University of Glasgow. Although no universal conclusion can be drawn from the research, due to its small sample scale, it adds to the ever-growing body of research performed in the field of ALN and ESOL. It is hoped the findings from the study will inform practice by identifying any areas of concern and communicating any issues to the appropriate policy makers to enhance future practice and development in the field of ALN and ESOL in Scotland for the good of both providers and learners.

#### Background

A major initiative began in 2000 to improve the literacy and numeracy skills of Scottish adults. At the same time, however, the demographics of Scotland began to change considerably, with an increasing number of adults requiring assistance with English skills and the Scottish Executive began to fund ESOL provision in 2001 through Communities Scotland's Learning Connections and Literacies partnerships (Scottish Executive, 2005b:2). However, the prominence of ESOL has continued to grow since then.

The increase in ESOL learners in Scotland and ESOL literacies, the term used for the publicly funded provision and practice of ESOL in ALN streams, provides the background of this study. My research will investigate the impact that the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL has had on the provision and practice of ALN education in Scotland.

#### Aims and Objectives

In aiming to investigate the main research question, various areas relating to the provision, teaching and learning of ESOL and ALN are investigated;

- 1) How has the increase in learner numbers impacted on
  - a) programme management?

b) the role of the tutor?

- 2) What has been the impact on teaching and learning?
- 3) In what ways do ESOL as a field of practice and ESOL literacies teaching and learning differ?
- 4) How do ESOL and ESOL literacies practices differ from ALN?
- 5) What areas of provision require improvement and further development?

### Research Methods

Questionnaires were distributed to managers and tutors involved in current practice in a wide geographical area of Scotland, to ascertain how the increase in learner numbers has impacted on them and how they have coped with the challenge. Government initiatives and developments will also be discussed.

### Main findings

Funding emerged as a major issue with providers. The Government has, however, responded to this with additional funding now being made available and this will be welcomed by our providers.

A resource base, with a range of materials to suit various abilities and differing topics, and which could be accessed by both providers and tutors, would be very advantageous.

Whilst having ESOL and ALN learners in the same group can have many positive impacts on the learners, most felt it resulted in less effective teaching and learning, with the main view being it proved very demanding for the tutor. This may be due to the lack of literacy or ESOL training on the part of the tutor, however, and expertise in both areas would increase the tutors' confidence.

Our ESOL learners require both conversation and literacies assistance and, with conversation skills being a major element of ESOL teaching and learning, it may be worth considering having dedicated ESOL classes to begin with. The learners would benefit from the expertise of our trained ESOL tutors, improving their communication skills to then join a class of adult literacy learners to improve their reading and writing skills.

Teaching staff, however, would benefit from a more universal training infrastructure with a recognised qualification emerging from it.

There have been concerns raised about the appropriateness of placing ESOL in the ALN streams. There was debate over the wording of the definition for ESOL literacy learners, and the amended definition widened the access to provision, increasing the numbers and range of English and literacy skills. ESOL's position and legitimacy in the ALN agenda will, though, be addressed in the forthcoming 'refresh' of the ALNIS strategy.

Areas that may have implications for future practice, and may be worthy of future research, include a decrease in learner numbers in some areas, the irregularity of attendance by ESOL learners and up to what level of English competence should be taught in the ALN and ESOL classes. These issues could be viewed as having implications on areas such as funding, training and the recruitment of staff.

While it is quite a concern that many areas in the ESOL teaching and learning environment are still in need of improvement and further development, the increased demand for ESOL provision does not appear to have had a negative effect on ALN provision and practice, with the findings indicating that most learners currently awaiting tuition are ESOL learners.

Also, although extensive research has been performed surrounding the field of ESOL, work is still being done to fulfill the Scottish Executive's commitment to monitoring, reviewing and adjusting our excellent ALNIS strategy



UNIVERSITY  
*of*  
GLASGOW

Department of Adult and Continuing Education

**Adult Literacy, Numeracy and ESOL: What impact has the incorporation and inclusion of  
ESOL had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacy and Numeracy education in  
Scotland?**

Eleanor Galloway

Dissertation submitted in part fulfillment of the degree of  
Master of Science: Teaching Adults

2008

---

## **Acknowledgements**

I would like to thank Dr. Ralf St. Clair for his continued guidance and support with this dissertation and Ms. Kathy Maclachlan for her assistance at the start of the study. I also express gratitude to all the managers and tutors who participated by completing questionnaires and providing their professional views.

## **Abstract**

A major initiative began in 2000 to improve the literacy and numeracy skills of Scottish adults. At the same time, however, the demographics of Scotland began to change considerably, with an increasing number of adults requiring assistance with English skills. Highlighted as a priority group in the Adult Literacy and Numeracy (ALN) Strategy (Scottish Executive, 2001), the Scottish Executive began to fund ESOL (English for Speakers of Other Languages) provision in 2001 through Communities Scotland's Learning Connections and Literacies partnerships (Scottish Executive, 2005b:2). However, the prominence of ESOL has continued to grow since then. This demographical change was acknowledged, and welcomed, by the Scottish Government, with various research projects being performed, resulting in major initiatives and developments.

The aim of this study is to investigate how this growing demand in publicly funded ESOL provision has impacted on the provision and practice of ALN in Scotland. Questionnaires were distributed to managers and tutors involved in current practice in a wide geographical area of Scotland, to ascertain how the increase in learner numbers has impacted on them and how they have coped with the challenge. Government initiatives and developments will be discussed, with related literature being referred to.

It is hoped the findings from this study will inform practice by identifying any areas of concern and communicating any issues to the appropriate policy makers to enhance future provision for the good of both providers and learners.

## Glossary

ABE	Adult Basic Education
ALN	Adult Literacy and Numeracy
ALNIS	Adult Literacy and Numeracy in Scotland
CELTA	Certificate in English Language Teaching to Adults
CLD	Community Learning and Development
EFL	English for Speakers of Other Languages
ESF	European Social Fund
ESOL	English for Speakers of Other languages
EU	European Union
FE	Further Education
GCVS	Glasgow Council for the Voluntary Sector
IALS	International Adult Literacy Survey
ITALL	Introductory Training in Adult Literacies Learning
LiC	Literacies in the Community
NASS	National Asylum Support Service
SRIF	Scottish Refugee Integration Forum
TEFL	Teaching English as a Foreign Language
TESOL	Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

## Contents

Abstract .....	i
Acknowledgements .....	ii
Glossary .....	iii
Contents .....	iv
Chapter One Introduction .....	1-5
Chapter Two Review of literature on initiatives and current provision	
2.1 Adult Literacy and Numeracy (ALN) in Scotland.....	6-10
2.2 English for Speakers of Other languages (ESOL).....	10-16
2.3 English for Speakers of Other languages (ESOL) Literacies ...	16-19
Chapter Three Methodology .....	20-25
Chapter Four Data Analysis	
4.1 Managers Questionnaires Results .....	26-33
4.2 Tutors Questionnaire Results .....	34-45
Chapter Five Discussion .....	46-53
Chapter Six Conclusion .....	54-56
References .....	57-61
Appendices	
Appendix 1 Plain Language Statement for Tutors .....	61
Appendix 2 Plain Language Statement for Managers .....	62
Appendix 3 Questionnaire for Tutors .....	63-68
Appendix 4 Questionnaire for Managers .....	69-75
Appendix 5 Ethics Application Form Approval .....	76

## **Chapter One**

### **Introduction**

#### **1.1 Background to the study**

The demographics of Scotland have changed considerably in recent years (Scottish Executive, 2007a), with a major factor being the arrival of asylum seekers and refugees after 2000, following an agreement between the National Asylum Support Service (NASS) and Glasgow City Council. This resulted in a majority of migrants and refugees initially settling in the Glasgow area, with the numbers growing from 500-600 in 2000 to between 10,000 and 11,000 in 2004 (Scottish Government., 2007c). Furthermore, from May 2004 onwards, the enlargement of the European Union (EU) produced an influx of migrant workers from the EU Accession States (A8), particularly Poland (Scottish Government, 2007c). This dispersal and inward migration was welcomed and encouraged by the Scottish Government, seen as ‘key to the economic and social prosperity of Scotland’ and a very welcome boost to Scotland’s declining population (COSLA, 2007). In fact, the Scottish Executive announced a Fresh Talent Initiative in February 2003, which set out to reverse the effects of population decline through greater retention of people and in-migration. Scotland’s First Minister advised “I want Scotland to be the most welcoming country in the world. I believe that we can attract people from the rest of the UK, from Europe and from further afield to come and make a contribution to our increasingly successful economy” (Scottish Executive News Release, 2004).

However, in order to make an effective contribution and also to cope with everyday life in Scotland, these migrants had to learn English. While Scotland does have a long history of

supporting second language acquisition (Scottish Executive, 2005a), having already settled many minority ethnic groups, the Scottish Government acknowledged that the initial dispersal programme had not catered for the large numbers arriving and adult education providers were left to improvise (Scottish Executive, 2005b). As a result, the huge increase in students, especially in Glasgow, led to pressure on rooms, staffing, teaching resources and facilities (Scottish Executive, 2005b:20).

It is also now stipulated that an applicant for British citizenship must show ‘sufficient knowledge of a language to be determined by possession of a specified certificate or by taking the citizenship test’ (Scottish Executive, 2007a:6). This recent change to the UK naturalisation regulations is likely to have an impact on the numbers of learners seeking assistance in the future (Scottish Executive, 2007), and will require providers to become familiar with Home Office policies regarding citizenship and to gain knowledge of the teaching and learning required for the test.

A national response was required to deal with the burdens already placed on the existing infrastructure and to cater for the future increase in learner numbers. The Scottish Executive, as part of its initiative in promoting Adult Literacy, Numeracy (ALN) and ESOL (English for Speakers of Other Languages), began to fund ESOL provision in 2001 through Communities Scotland’s Learning Connections and Literacies partnerships (Scottish Executive, 2005b).

The increase in ESOL learners in Scotland and ESOL literacies, the term used for the publicly funded provision and practice of ESOL in ALN streams, provides the background of this study. My research will investigate the impact that the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL has had on the provision and practice of ALN education in Scotland.

## 1.2 Overview of the study

Being a tutor for both ESOL and ALN, the increase in learner numbers did have an impact on my role and, through observation and some discussion with colleagues, I realised it was having an impact on them also. I decided it would be very useful, interesting, worthwhile and informative for future provision and practice in the field of ALN and ESOL to investigate the impact it was having on providers and tutors in various areas of Scotland. The focus of my study will be to address the main research question:

What impact has the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacy and Numeracy education in Scotland?

In aiming to investigate this effectively and thoroughly, various areas relating to the provision, teaching and learning of ESOL and ALN require to be investigated and my study will, thus, endeavour to address the following questions;

- 1) How has the increase in learner numbers impacted on
  - a) programme management?
  - b) the role of the tutor?
- 2) What has been the impact on teaching and learning?
- 3) In what ways do ESOL as a field of practice and ESOL literacies teaching and learning differ?
- 4) How do ESOL and ESOL literacies practices differ from ALN?
- 5) What areas of provision require improvement and further development?

The method of my research is the distribution of questionnaires, relevant to their differing professional roles, to managers and tutors involved in current practice in a wide geographical area

of Scotland. The aim is to ascertain how the increased demand for ESOL provision has impacted on them and how they coped with the challenge.

Questionnaires were chosen as the source of data for various reasons, including the busy schedules of the respondents and the fact that most tutors are sessional and can work in various locations. The wide geographical area covered was also a main factor in this choice, as the travelling time and expense involved in conducting interviews would be too great. Space was provided for comments and anonymity ensured.

Although no universal conclusion can be drawn from my research, due to its small sample scale, it is hoped the findings from this study will inform practice by identifying any areas of concern and communicating any issues to the appropriate policy makers to enhance future practice and development in the field of ALN and ESOL in Scotland for the good of both providers and learners.

#### Format of the study

The study begins with an overview of the existing ALN strategy in Scotland. Focus will be on Government initiatives, their progress and development and areas of concern identified in research for future development. Discussion will then concentrate on ESOL teaching and learning as a field of practice. Its growing prominence and demographic change due to the increase in learner numbers has resulted in various research projects being performed and the findings from these will be discussed. The aim of this is to provide an insight into both ALN and ESOL before going on to discuss the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL in ALN streams. The final section of the literature review will focus on Esol literacies. The diverse needs of ESOL literacies learners, the definition adopted for them and the widening of access to publicly funded ESOL provision due to the

wording of this definition are some areas that will be investigated. The method and sampling choice of my research will be explained in detail in Chapter Three, including comments on its limitations and benefits. The paper will then detail and discuss the findings, followed by the conclusion, commenting on subsequent improvements and implications for future provision.

## Chapter Two

This section of the paper provides a review of literature relating to research, initiatives and developments in ALN and ESOL in Scotland. It begins with an overview of the ALN strategy, briefly mentioning how ESOL was included in this strategy. The growing prominence of ESOL and ESOL as a field of practice will then be discussed. In the final section of the chapter, focus will be on ESOL literacies, the term used for the provision of ESOL in ALN streams.

### 2.1 Adult Literacy and Numeracy (ALN) in Scotland

—  
A major initiative aimed at improving the literacy and numeracy skills of adults in Scotland began in 2000. It was prompted by the International Adult Literacy Survey (IALS), a significant piece of research carried out between 1994 and 1998 that influenced policy in many countries (Scottish Executive, 2001). Britain participated, which resulted in the Adult Literacy Survey taking place in 1996. Findings from this suggested that around 800,000 Scottish adults, or around 23%, had low levels of literacy and/or numeracy skills while another 30% possessed skills inadequate to meet the demands in society (Scottish Executive, 2001).

#### Government initiatives

In June 2000, the Minister for Enterprise and Lifelong Learning appointed a team to undertake the task of ‘providing a focus for the development of national policy and strategy on adult literacy and numeracy’ (Scottish Executive, 2001:5), arguing that improvements were crucial to social justice, community development, social cohesion and a competitive economy (Leavey, 2007).

A set of good practice guidelines, the ‘Literacies in the Community (LiC) Pack’, was developed as a framework to establish quality in teaching and learning (Tett et al, 2006:20). This was followed by the publication of the ‘[Adult Literacy and Numeracy in Scotland](#) (ALNIS)’ report in July 2001, which outlined the Scottish Executive’s strategy for ALN (Scottish Executive, 2006:49). It was advocated that a social practices model of teaching and learning be adopted, with goals and learning content coming from the learners’ lives and aspirations. Literacy is viewed as a set of real-life practices instead of stand-alone functional skills and it is recognised that literacy and numeracy are complex capabilities rather than simply basic skills or cognitive abilities (Scottish Executive, 2006:55). This social practices approach is reflected in the definition of ALN given in the ALNIS report; “The ability to read and write and use numeracy, to handle information, to express ideas and opinions, to make decisions and solve problems, as family members, workers, citizens and lifelong learners” (Scottish Executive, 2001:7). Individual learning plans, designed around the individual needs of the learners, were viewed as being at the heart of the teaching and learning processes. They were to be negotiated between tutor and learner, to identify learning goals, record and recognise progress towards them and lead to the development of new goals (Leavey, 2007).

Learning Connections, the development engine for ALN in Scotland, was set up in January 2003 within Communities Scotland (Leavey, 2007). It was to focus on research, development, training, and improving the quality of provision (Scottish Executive, 2004). Funding of £24m was made available, the first significant investment in Adult Literacies provision in over 25 years, to provide over 33,000 new learning opportunities in the first three years (Scottish Executive, 2001:3), and was routed through local authorities to Community Learning Strategy Partnerships, who were expected to focus on seven priority groups:

- People with limited initial education, particularly young adults
- Unemployed people and workers facing redundancy
- People with English as a second or additional language
- People who live in disadvantaged areas
- Workers in low-skilled jobs
- People on low incomes
- People with health problems and disabilities (Scottish Executive, 2001:13).

#### Monitoring of progress and priorities for future action

Progress has been monitored by the Scottish Executive, with regular reports being published. In September 2004, ministers hailed the strategy's success in supporting over 71,000 people in its first three years (Leavey, 2007). Fiona Hyslop, the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Lifelong Learning, recently advised that since 2001, 180,000 individuals have improved their literacy and numeracy, adding that this is 'a life-changing step for those individuals, for their families and for the communities in which they live' (Scottish Government, 2007:2). By 2008, more than £65 million will have been invested at a local level for ALN work (Leavey, 2007:4). This has been routed through local authority areas to community learning and development strategy partnerships to fund local action (Scottish Executive, 2006b:57).

Scotland's approach to ALN, especially the way it focuses on community learning and promotes learner involvement was commented on very positively by Merrifield in 'Why England should look north for inspiration' (2005). She commented that 'For the last five years, Scotland has been developing a remarkable adult literacy and numeracy strategy', adding that 'We all have much to learn and Scotland is helping move the whole field forward' (Merrifield, 2005:20).

Whilst all this is very re-assuring and positive, with progress and developments obviously being made, findings from recent research carried out in Scotland have shown, however, that further work is still required to achieve the original ALNIS objectives, and priorities for future action have been identified. The ALNIS report is currently being refreshed and the ‘Evidence Report For ALNIS ‘Refresh’’, produced by York Consulting in November 2006 on behalf of the Scottish Executive, forms a key information source in developing a new strategy up to 2011 (Scottish Executive, 2006b:1).

Although Scotland claims to adopt a social practice model of teaching and learning, it emerges from this recent research that not all practitioners are sufficiently aware of what the social practice model is and how it translates into the delivery of ALN learning and measuring progress. It has been recognised that the social practice model can be resource-intensive and time-consuming to record and track, due to the highly tailored, learner-led ethos of this model and the fact that adult learners are not a homogenous group (Scottish Executive, 2006b:117). In order for the social practice model to be fully adopted in the Scottish strategy, there is a need for further training on what it means to deliver ALN through this model (Scottish Executive, 2006b:137). However, the ‘Evaluation of the Scottish Adult Literacy and Numeracy Initiative’, completed in 2006, advised that ALN tutors are amongst the most over-stretched group of educational providers, who often are on hourly paid contracts with little access to staff development (Tett et al, 2006). There are also concerns about the teaching workforce for ALN being highly fragmented, made up of voluntary and part-time workers (Scottish Executive, 2006:97).

Growing prominence of ESOL within ALN

The growing prominence of ESOL within ALN is also viewed as an issue for the ‘Refresh Strategy’ to consider (Scottish Executive, 2006b). Although highlighted as a priority group in the ALNIS report, ESOL was not given a very high profile to begin with. Listing factors associated with low literacy and numeracy skills, the report commented that ‘in Britain as a whole having English as a second or additional language and being born outside the UK emerge as factors but further research would be required to understand their influence in Scotland’ (Scottish Executive, 2001:8). Furthermore, an Evaluation Report from 2003 on the piloting of the ‘Introductory Training in Adult Literacies Learning (ITALL)’ qualification for tutors is said to mention ESOL only 3 times, but Numeracy 15 times (Scottish Executive, 2005:20). From my own personal experience, I can confirm that ESOL was not mentioned at all during my training, which focussed mainly on adult literacy. The growth of ESOL over the last few years has, however, raised its profile significantly and emphasis has been placed on the need to clarify the position of ESOL and decide on its legitimacy in the ALN agenda (Scottish Executive, 2006b:141).

The next section of this chapter will concentrate on ESOL as a field of practice, its growing prominence and subsequent Government initiatives.

## **2.2 English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)**

ESOL is the term used most frequently nowadays to describe English Language learning for those whose first language is not English (Scottish Executive, 2006:3). The British Council provide a brief definition of ESOL which is relevant to my study; ‘ESOL refers mainly to learning English as a new resident in an English-speaking country’ (British Council, 2008). The Enterprise, Transport

and Lifelong Learning Department defines adult ESOL learners as ‘those for whom English is not a first language and who need spoken and written English for everyday life and to participate in the labour market, learning, their local communities and wider society’ (Scottish Executive, 2007a:6). It is distinguished from the field of EFL (English as a Foreign Language) by being aimed at students who need English because they are living in a country where English is spoken widely as the native language, and is generally publicly funded (Scottish Executive, 2007a:6). EFL is generally taught at fee-paying language schools and colleges for academic purposes. The British Council defines EFL as ‘... learning and using English as an additional language in a non-English speaking country’ and go on to say that ‘EFL includes short summer courses in an English speaking country...’ (British Council, 2008). Scotland has a thriving EFL industry, especially for international students, and the contribution that this sector makes is recognised by the Government (Scottish Executive, 2007a:6), but it is quite distinct from ESOL.

### Government initiatives

As mentioned previously, the existing infrastructure had not prepared for the increase in learner numbers and the Scottish Refugee Integration Forum (SRIF), established in January 2002, advised of ‘an urgent need for adequate resources to be made available to support the provision of English language tuition for those asylum seekers and refugees who require it’ (Scottish Executive, 2003b: 20). In partnership with the Scottish Executive, they published an action plan in 2003 focussing on the provision of learning opportunities and recommending that the Scottish Executive take the lead in developing a national ESOL Strategy, building on the recent adult literacy strategy. They stressed the urgency by advising that action should be taken prior to the agreement of a national strategy, to allow ESOL learners to effectively participate in society as quickly as possible (Scottish Executive, 2003b:20). The recommendations of the SRIF action plan were endorsed by

Scottish Ministers and 'Life through Learning: Learning through life', published in 2003 as part of Scotland's Learning for Life Strategy, pledged the Scottish Executive to implement them (Scottish Executive, 2007a:7).

This led to the first in-depth research investigation into ESOL, as ESOL in Scotland had been little studied (Scottish Executive, 2005b:1). The 'National "English for speakers of other languages" (ESOL) Strategy: Mapping Exercise and Scoping Study of English' was produced in January 2005, providing quantitative data, previously scarce, on the scale, nature and quality of current provision, the size and demographic profile of the ESOL student body, the qualifications and professionalism of ESOL practitioners, and identifying any barriers to learning (Scottish Executive, 2005b). Findings from this study showed that ESOL in Scotland faced a constantly shifting pattern of demand and inelastic supply (Scottish Executive, 2005a). The population of potential learners was shown as around 50,000 with only approximately 9000 enrolled in classes in 2003/4. One tenth of this number were international fee-paying students and the remainder made up of EU citizens, refugees or asylum seekers and settled ethnic minority students. Although ESOL classes were running in all council areas, this number of potential learners showed that there was a requirement for more provision (Scottish Executive, 2005a).

Work then began towards the development of an Adult ESOL Strategy, a draft being produced in the latter part of 2005. The 'Adult ESOL Strategy for Scotland, Consultation Paper' produced in October 2005, provided feedback on this draft and a revised strategy and associated action plan was finally completed in March 2007. Again, an unmet demand for ESOL provision in Scotland was highlighted with improvements and solutions needed at national and local levels (Scottish Executive, 2007a).

A further study, 'Examining the Impact of EU Enlargement and the introduction of the UK Citizenship Test on Provision of English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) in Scotland 2007', was commissioned in January 2007 by the former Enterprise, Transport and Lifelong Learning Department of the Scottish Government. Findings from this showed that the demand from A8 nationals has been significant in nearly all areas of Scotland with demand outweighing supply, although this does vary in different areas (Scottish Executive, 2007b:13). The number of learners taking ESOL classes in Scotland increased from 14,500 in 2003-04 to more than 19,000 in 2005-06. There were almost 12,000 enrolments in Further Education college classes in 2004-05 (Scottish Executive, 2007b:2). Nearly 80 per cent of enrolments on publicly-funded ESOL courses in Scotland are in Further Education (FE) Colleges, around 18 per cent in Community Learning and Development (CLD) and around 3 per cent in the voluntary sector with the bulk of provision being centred on the cities of Edinburgh and Glasgow. Providers were struggling to meet the demands of running enough classes, resulting in waiting lists. More adult learners are also able to attend full-time, while in the recent past part-time provision was almost universal, and this demand placed further burdens on providers. There were also concerns that the changes had impacted adversely on ethnic minority students, with fewer enrolling than in the past (Scottish Executive, 2005b).

With these various investigations all coming to the same conclusion - that demand outweighs provision - it is quite a concern that it has taken seven years of research and development to finally form an ESOL strategy. It is also worrying that even the most recent research still highlights this issue.

## Teaching and Materials

There have also been concerns from teachers regarding the lack of specific training and the absence of any induction. The problems faced in dealing with very mixed classes was raised, with teachers often being presented with learners requiring various levels of English skills, special learning needs or physical disabilities. Those previously trained and experienced in teaching EFL, in this country and abroad, did not feel adequately qualified to teach ESOL (Scottish Executive, 2005b). Some felt that the available materials were not appropriate and often had to spend time producing relevant learning resources themselves in order to meet the very diverse individual needs of the learners, a very time consuming activity.

Furthermore, volunteers have played a large part in the provision of language support, often finding themselves teaching from beginner to advanced level of learner. Edinburgh and Glasgow have the most flourishing voluntary sectors. Umbrella organisations such as the Glasgow Council for the Voluntary Sector (GCVS) co-ordinate classes across the city, often in ALN partnership arrangements (Scottish Executive, 2005b:22). They responded, in October 2005, to the 'Adult ESOL Strategy in Scotland' stating that, although the contribution of volunteer tutors is recognised, they merit more recognition and their learning and development needs require to be met (GCVS, 2005:4). Although work is ongoing and providers are endeavouring to meet the challenges placed upon them, there remains a need for professional development in the teaching sector along with adequate and relevant teaching materials.

## Funding

Although the Scottish Government has increased funding over the last few years to tackle the growth in demand, research has shown that there is some concern amongst ESOL practitioners that ALN partnership funding cannot always provide adequate and appropriate tuition for ESOL students due to their wider range of communicative needs compared to native-speaking literacy students (Scottish Executive, 2005b: iv), hence making it more expensive to provide, and that linking ESOL with ABE (Adult Basic Education) was often viewed as more problematic than helpful (Scottish Executive, 2005b:1). These concerns will be discussed in greater length in the following section of the chapter. An additional £1.7m annually was committed to meet the demand for more ESOL in FE colleges, particularly in Glasgow, subsequently increasing to £2m in 2004-6 (Scottish Executive, 2005b:2). Aiming at improving progression, inclusion and the quality of teaching, the Scottish Government pledged to increase funding by £5 million during 2007/08 in order to create around an additional 4000 classroom places and to set up a National ESOL Panel to monitor the quality and quantity of ESOL provision in Scotland (Scottish Executive, 2007b:8). A very recent announcement has advised that ‘asylum seekers and others new to Scotland are to benefit from a further £9 million of funding for English language classes. Over the next three years the new funding could deliver up to 7,000 more places for migrant workers, asylum seekers, refugees and others who are eager to learn English’ (Scottish Executive News Release, 2008). This will be welcomed by the ESOL practitioners who voiced concern about the adequacy of ALN funding for ESOL provision.

Overall, discussion over the last few years has emphasised the great need for adequate and good quality ESOL provision in Scotland and this has been recognised by the Government. With the recent announcement of additional funding, research findings, subsequent Government

initiatives and the continued dedication of providers, Scotland can now strive to assist our ‘New Scots’ (Scottish Executive, 2007a:3) to effectively manage in work and daily life whilst contributing to the social and economic prosperity of Scotland.

This chapter has so far provided an overview of the ALN strategy in Scotland and discussed the growing prominence of ESOL. Definitions have been provided for ALN and ESOL as separate fields of practice. The final section of the chapter will focus on ESOL literacies, the provision and practice of ESOL within publicly funded ALN streams. A separate definition has been adopted for this category of provision and, in order to qualify for assistance, ESOL learners are expected to fall within the Scottish Executive's definition of an Adult ESOL literacies learner.

### **2.3 ESOL Literacies**

Agreeing on a definition for ESOL learners who qualify for tuition in the ALN streams has proved problematic. The Scottish Executive’s draft ‘Adult ESOL Strategy for Scotland’ defined an adult ESOL literacies learner as ‘A person who has little or no literacy in his/her own mother tongue and who has little or no literacy in English and whose spoken English may range from basic to fluent’ (Scottish Executive, 2007a:4). The consultation paper produced in response to the draft argued that this definition potentially excluded many people from ALN funded ESOL provision. It pointed out that previous research had shown that the majority of ESOL students can read and write in their own language (Scottish Executive, 2006:10). It was felt the definition was unclear and ‘strained the conscience of providers to deny funding to those individuals (perhaps the majority of applicants) who had real English language needs but whose mother tongue literacy was (probably) of a good standard’ (Scottish Executive, 2006:10). The Glasgow Council for the Voluntary Sector also expressed concern:

‘We are also confused about the fact we cannot take on learners who are literate in their own language. In order for ESOL learners to integrate into society, they need literacy and numeracy help and how do you define this type of learner according to the definition set by government?’ (GCVS, 2005:5)

How someone was assessed for their level of literacy in their mother tongue was also an issue.

In short, there was considerable pressure on the Department to revisit the definition of an ‘Adult ESOL Literacies Learner’ from the point of view of the provider (Scottish Executive, 2006:39). Members of the Adult Literacies Network agreed the definition should be revised to read ‘A person who has little or no literacy in English and whose spoken English may range from basic to fluent ’ (GCVS, 2005:6). Respondents in the consultation paper, also stressing that it is the literacy level in *English* that is most important, suggested the wording ‘A person who has little or no literacy in English **and** who may or may not have literacy in another language **and** whose spoken English may range from basic to fluent’ (Scottish Executive, 2006:11). Interestingly though, as far back as November 2003 the Glasgow ESOL Forum developed a consultation document for a teaching qualification - Professional Development Award: Teaching Adult ESOL Literacies - and gave a very similar definition of an adult ESOL literacies learner for the purposes of the award: ‘Someone who may or may not be literate in his/her own mother-tongue and who has little or no literacy in English; whose spoken English may range from basic to fluent’ (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:5). The amended definition subsequently widened access to ALN funded ESOL provision, increasing the number of learners and highlighting their varied needs.

### Teaching and Learning

The method of teaching and learning differs quite considerably from the ALN classroom because ESOL learners require conversational skills, talk is work in the ESOL classroom and the most

significant mode of learning for ESOL learners is through group interaction and opportunities to practice speaking and listening. Thus, an emphasis on individualised teaching and learning may not support the needs of adult ESOL learners (Roberts et al, 2004:7).

No accredited teaching qualification for adult ESOL literacies existed. With adult ESOL literacies tuition being delivered either by adult literacies tutors, many of whom having no training in ESOL methodology, or by ESOL teachers with no training in teaching literacies, there was a demonstrable need for an award (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:8). The Glasgow ESOL Forum carried out surveys in 2003, leading to a Consultation Document to develop a teaching qualification (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:7). The Professional Development Award '*Teaching Adult ESOL Literacies*', building upon the experience and skills of the teachers surveyed, was accredited in April 2005 by the SQA (Scottish Executive, 2007a:12). It is envisaged that the unit will become part of the National Training Framework for Literacies being developed by Communities Scotland and is in accordance with the seven Guiding Principles of the 'LiC' pack (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:7), incorporating a social practices approach to adult ESOL literacies. This qualification is aimed at enhancing literacy training for ESOL teachers, with consequent benefits for ESOL learners (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:4). There remains, however, a need to develop another qualification in ESOL methodology for adult literacies tutors, building on their expertise (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:10).

Discussion here has highlighted concerns and issues in areas such as funding, teacher training and the diverse and complex needs of learners attending ESOL literacy classes. The widening of access to provision has further increased learner numbers. Providers and tutors have been faced

with challenges, changes and the knowledge that learner numbers are expected to increase further in the future.

The growing prominence of ESOL in Scotland provides the main focus of my research. The subsequent challenges and changes faced by providers due to its incorporation and inclusion in publicly funded ALN streams provide the focus of my research. The paper will now concentrate on the research I performed with managers and tutors engaged in current practices in a wide geographical area of Scotland.

### **Chapter Three**

#### **Methodology**

As discussed in previous chapters, a major initiative to improve the literacy and numeracy skills of Scottish adults began in 2000. At the same time, however, the demographics of Scotland began to change dramatically and there was a growing need for more English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) provision, raising the prominence of ESOL as a priority group in the Adult Literacy and Numeracy (ALN) strategy in Scotland.

Being a tutor in both ALN and ESOL, the increase in ESOL learner numbers had an impact on my professional role in a number of ways and, through observation and conversation with other tutors and tutor organisers, I realised that it was also having an impact on them.

This made me begin to wonder how this change was affecting current ALN provision and practice in Scotland and was the impetus for my research question:

What impact has the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacy and Numeracy education in Scotland?

### Sampling

My experience as a practitioner in the field helped me to decide which organisations would be able to assist me best in my research. Having a thorough knowledge of the topic, ‘the group that will have the data I want is immediately apparent’ (Borg and Gall, 1989:426). Participants for this project were ALN and ESOL tutors and managers/tutor organisers currently engaged in practices in a wide geographical area of Scotland. In Chapter One, I mentioned that findings from a study carried out in 2007 (Scottish Executive, 2007) showed that the demand from the European Union

(A8) nationals has been significant in nearly all areas of Scotland, with demand outweighing supply, although this does vary in different areas. It proved important, therefore, that my research should cover a wide geographical area to achieve a clearer picture of the Scottish situation. One hundred and twenty-six questionnaires were distributed overall, focussing on a small scale of professionals from each area. My research is qualitative with the emphasis being on their professional views and the data analysed thematically.

The idea behind qualitative research is to purposefully select participants of sites that will best help the researcher understand the problem and the research question. This does not necessarily suggest random sampling or selection of a large number of participants and sites, as typically found in quantitative research (Cresswell, 2003:185).

I approached Local Authorities, who provide tuition for the general public, and some Voluntary Partnerships Organisations, whose Workplace Literacies programmes offer assistance for ALN and ESOL learners in their place of employment. This provided a varied sample of data, covering a wider scale of practice.

Because there is always a limit to how many respondents we can contact or how many sites we can visit, we have to make some principled decisions on how to select our respondents. The main goal of sampling is to find individuals who can provide rich and varied insights into the phenomenon under investigation so as to maximize what we can learn. This goal is best achieved by means of some sort of purposeful sampling (Dornyei, 2007:126).

Contact

The initial contact was by telephone, in order to introduce myself, to explain my research and to gain the verbal approval of the managers to the completion and distribution of my questionnaires.

As Borg and Gall advise:

Contacting the respondents before sending a questionnaire has been found in several studies to increase the response rate. The precontact can take the form of a letter, postcard, or telephone call. Evidence to date suggests that telephone calls are the most effective, alert them to the imminent arrival of the questionnaire and also add a more personal or human face on the research (Borg and Gall, 1989:436).

All those I contacted agreed to co-operate, advising they would be happy to distribute the documentation amongst relevant staff and confirmed their approval by email. The documentation consisted of a Plain Language Statement, for Tutors and for Managers respectively (Appendices 1 & 2), and a Questionnaire, again one for each with some different questions due to differences in their professional roles (Appendices 3 & 4).

### Questionnaires

Questionnaires were used as the source of data for various reasons, mainly the busy schedules of the respondents and the fact that most tutors are sessional and work in various locations. The wide geographical area covered was also a main factor in this choice, as the travelling time and expense involved in conducting interviews would be too great. Although not as effective and informative as interviews, and, as Dornyei argues, they ‘can limit the depth of the investigation and provide a rather ‘thin’ description of the target phenomena’ (2007:115), questionnaires do offer other advantages. They can be completed at a convenient time, increase the possibility of a high return rate and, due to the anonymity of the questionnaires, the respondents are more likely to be honest and frank in their responses. According to Borg and Gall, ‘with careful planning and sound methodology, the mailed questionnaire can be a very valuable research tool in education’

(1989:423). They view questionnaires as being efficient in terms of researcher time, effort and financial resource, but also argue that anonymity can pose problems. 'Follow-ups are difficult and inefficient because non-responding individuals cannot be identified. Furthermore, you may not be able to make some of the statistical breakdowns of the group that may be desirable' (Borg & Gall, 1989:433). As it was necessary for my research to be able to identify geographical areas of response, as well as organisations, the questionnaires were numbered, with each organisation given a different number. This did not, however, interfere with the anonymity of the respondents as the organisations and the numbers allocated to them were not disclosed in the study. Although I could identify the managers who responded by the number given to their organisation, confidentiality was assured.

### Content

I took guidance from Borg and Gall (1989) in the construction of the questionnaire, adding my name and address at the beginning and end, including brief and clear instructions and organising the questionnaire in a logical sequence.

It involved a mixture of open and closed questions, to provide information about the respondents' roles and to allow them to comment further on their answers. The open-form questions were vital for the quality of my investigation as I was seeking the professional experience and views of the practitioners and was unable to obtain this by interview. This is in line with the view of Borg and Gall, who argue that 'The qualitative nature of the information sought makes it necessary in this case to use open form' (1989:428). Dornyei argues that

'Open-ended questions – followed by some blank space for the respondent to fill in. Although not particularly suited for truly qualitative, exploratory research, some open ended questions can still have merit. By permitting greater freedom of expression, open-format items can provide a far greater richness than fully

quantitative data. The open responses can offer graphic examples and can also lead us to identify issues not previously anticipated' (2007:107).

Additional space was also provided at the end for any additional comments the participants felt were appropriate.

Being quite knowledgeable in the field, great care was taken to avoid 'leading questions' and 'presuming questions' (Bell, 2007:143) to allow the respondents to give their own professional views or to air a grievance (Bell, 2007:137). As Bell advises, 'When they are included it is often because the researcher holds strong views about a subject and overlooks the fact that everyone may not feel the same way' (2007:143). Also, 'If the subject is given hints as to the type of answer you would prefer, there is some tendency to give you what you want' (Borg and Gall, 1989:431).

### Overview

The questionnaires were distributed and returned during the month of May, 2008 and the response was more than satisfactory with nine managers (a 50% response rate) and twenty-seven tutors (a 25% response rate) returning questionnaires.

As previously mentioned, the responses received from both open and closed questions were arranged thematically, in line with the view of Cresswell; 'The researcher collects open-ended, emerging data with the primary intent of developing themes from the data' (2003:18). The managers' and tutors' questionnaires were analysed separately, followed by a discussion on the findings from both.

Participants were advised that, on completion, copies of the research report would be forwarded to the managers/tutor organisers for their use and for distribution to their tutors. This

would inform them of concerns raised by other practitioners, highlight emerging themes that require to be addressed and provide professional views on potential improvements and developments. Although no universal conclusions can be drawn, due to the limitations and small scale of my research, it is hoped the project will be informative for practice and useful for the future provision of courses both for ESOL literacy learners and for providers.

## **Chapter Four**

### **Data Analysis**

As previously stated, the questionnaires distributed to managers and tutors differed in some areas, as they were designed around their professional roles. The responses are, therefore, analysed in separate sections of this chapter, providing information on both management and classroom teaching and learning aspects.

#### **4.1 Managers' Questionnaire Results**

##### Response

Nine questionnaires were returned (a 50% response rate) covering several geographical areas of Scotland. Six of the questionnaires were from different Local Authorities and three from Voluntary Partnership Organisations. Whilst the answers to the closed questions provided valuable research information, the respondents were extremely helpful in commenting further on their responses, thus creating a more detailed description of ESOL provision in their areas and adding to the qualitative nature of my research project. As mentioned in the methodology section, the emphasis was on the professional views of the managers. Care has also been taken during the discussion to protect the anonymity of the respondents.

##### ESOL Demand

To begin with, the managers were asked if there had been an impact in their area due to the increasing number of ESOL learners since 2000. All nine reported a significant impact, with three of them indicating a very significant impact. Further sections of the questionnaire investigated how the organisations coped with the challenge of a surge in learner numbers, concentrating on areas

such as Waiting Lists, Teaching Staff, Learning and Teaching Materials, Funding and Plans for Future Provision (Appendix 4).

### Waiting Lists

Interestingly, although all areas reported a significant increase in ESOL learner numbers, five of the areas currently have no learners on waiting lists. Two of the areas with waiting lists are in the North of Scotland, one in the West and one in the East. The learners on these waiting lists all require ESOL assistance. Only one area (in the North) has a waiting list for ALN as well as ESOL.

*We have people on waiting lists for all 3 categories. The difference is that ESOL Learners are more likely to ask for help and are therefore more obvious – but in reality there are probably more people who ‘require assistance’ with Lit/Num – they just don’t come forward so readily- we therefore have to spend more time/resources engaging with them. (Manager (M) 12)*

This comment emphasises the perceived attitudinal difference between the two types of learners and highlights the importance of providing adequate resources for ESOL learners who are actively seeking assistance whilst continually striving to encourage our ALN learners to come forward for assistance.

Two areas, both from the East, reported that demand had not been as great recently, although they did not give any clear reasons why. This is probably an area that would benefit from further investigation. These managers advised;

*Classes still running though not to full capacity. After initial surge in numbers, there has been a marked decrease in learner numbers in the past six months. (M 19)*

*Demand seems to have levelled off. May be due to colleges also offering ESOL Courses – this may reduce our awareness of ‘numbers’ . (M 18)*

Another area, in Central Scotland, commented that they were actively encouraging ESOL learners to come forward for assistance.

*We will now have to instigate waiting lists which, for some learners, will act as a barrier to returning to learning. Our ESOL service is currently developing. Whilst we do not have waiting lists presently, it is likely that the impact of our recent publicity campaign will result in waiting lists being created. (M 4)*

From these comments, these organisations appear to have accepted and catered for the increased learner numbers in their areas.

One voluntary organisation showed how they worked in partnership with other organisations to provide assistance:

*By coming together as 4 organisations in 2004 to respond, we have been able to develop a richer partnership model – offering a range of provision and to attract funding.*

*We ensure that the ESOL Language needs are met by one of 4 organisations locally –By ensuring referrals and offering different levels, it does mean that ESOL Learners can find a course to suit their level. (M 12)*

The findings in this section were quite varied. Five areas currently have ESOL learners awaiting tuition whilst two areas reported a decrease in ESOL learner numbers recently, one of which currently has a waiting list. Only one area having ALN learners on a waiting list suggests that there are adequate services being provided for ALN whilst the providers are coping with the increase in ESOL learner numbers.

### Teaching Staff

Managers indicated that providing adequately qualified teachers required the investment of a great deal of time and money. Four areas, two from the East and two from the North, reported that they

had an adequate amount of staff in place to cope with the increase, but ESOL training was necessary. Four areas, in North, East and Central Scotland, reported they did not have enough teachers and remedied the situation by means of recruitment, increasing the hours of existing staff and training. The final area, in the West, had insufficient staff but had not yet remedied the situation.

On the subject of recruitment, one voluntary organisation added that

*I was surprised when I advertised how many ESOL qualified people there were in the community. A lot of these tutors had lived very varied lives and had gained their ESOL qualification to allow them to travel, so they came with a lot of varied skills including ESOL. (M 13)*

Although qualified to teach ESOL, some tutors did require additional training, and this same manager advised

*We organised our own training. Tutors were recruited who had adequate ESOL qualifications but needed training in the context which we expected them to work, mainly workplace. (M 13)*

The comments received on training highlight the added burden placed on managers and show how they organised a training infrastructure:

*Our ESOL partnership prioritised training and delivery. Existing tutors and newly recruited were supported to participate in the CELTA Course. (M 4)*

*We had a small core of trained ESOL Tutors, but we have also put in place a training infrastructure – 10 introductory ESOL courses this past year as well as monthly workshops for ESOL practitioners. (M 12)*

*We have a designated ESOL training officer who has been designing a two day induction course for prospective ESOL Tutors as well as 'In-service' shorter sessions on specific topics. Learning connections have also funded and held a CELTA training course recently. (M 12a)*

This information highlights the time, effort and finances required to ensure ESOL learners were being served professionally and effectively. As well as coping with the increased number of learners, the managers had the added burden of organising training for their tutors.

### Teaching Materials and Curriculum

Not only were more teaching staff required, but additional and relevant teaching materials were needed. Seven of the nine respondents reported that they did not have enough resources, although the available resources were suitable for some ESOL learners. One area in the North of Scotland commented, however, that the available resources were not suitable for that region.

*Obviously we had some but a lot not suitable for this rural area. Our training Officer has been creating region specific resources – a tutor pack with worksheets – living in the North – another partner has developed a survival English pack and video. (M12a)*

Other interesting comments about resources were;

*There seems to be a lack of materials aimed at integration, work preparation – also maybe work gearing materials for Eastern Europeans. (M 18)*

*Still a lack of materials for complete beginners. Internet a great source. (M19)*

*We work with ESOL mainly in the workplace so the employer has some input into our curriculum. (M13)*

*Dispersed staff have to plan to use specific resources held in central location – makes spontaneity difficult! (M16)*

*Purchased materials and resources. (M16)*

Most areas improvised by developing their own relevant resources, as the following information shows:

*Tutors got together to create resources relevant to groups of learners. We had a slight underspend in a budget and were able to use this to purchase new ESOL resources. We worked in partnership with the library services to access resources for ESOL reading groups. (M4)*

*We developed our own resources which is how we like to operate. We ran an ESOL pilot for Learning Connections which had budget to develop materials within a curriculum framework. (M13)*

Comments received here highlight how the providers improvised in the face of a lack of suitable teaching resources to cope with the demand. Both managers and tutors adapted available resources, developed some and, where there was available funding, purchased learning and teaching materials.

### Funding

Recruitment, training and resources all require funding and this emerged as a significant issue.

Although every area acknowledged that they received government funding, all apart from two said the funding was inadequate for the growing demand of ESOL. The manager from one of these two areas, however, commented further by adding;

*The ESOL Strategy Funding was adequate for 2007/8. However, delays in receiving this funding added pressure on staff. This problem has recurred in 2008/9 and is compounded by the fact that there is no information on funding plans from April 2009 onwards. (M5)*

Other negative comments on funding included:

*We are directly driven by funding sources. We cannot project forward when finance is unknown. (M18)*

*We could have used twice as much budget. The ESOL money came in a very short time frame; this meant that it was difficult to plan. The money was spent in a realive way not a procedure manner, but even so more courses could have been supported in the NHS and various other industries we were working with. (M13)*

*We were able to cope because we had managed to attract a fair bit of ESF Funding over the past 3 years for ESOL – otherwise this Scottish Government funding would not have been adequate. However it was a real plus point in that it can be used flexibly according to need (More flexible than ESF!). (M12)*

Other views on funding were that it was not evenly distributed:

*A recent mapping exercise indicated that the major funding shortage was with families in the community. (M13)*

*Too much ESOL money to FE Sector, more should be awarded to community-based, which can provide more childcare and remove other barriers. (M3)*

Present and future funding appears to be an important issue with the providers according to the views and comments given. There was a feeling it was not enough and not evenly distributed. They also seem a bit uncertain about future funding, which affects planning and progression.

#### Additional comments and future provision

In conclusion, the managers were asked to reflect on the current situation and provision for the future. All but two areas have made provision for the future. These plans include;

*We have applied for further funding from ESF to continue our ESOL Training and development programme. (M12a)*

*New ESF ESOL project*

- 1) to extend ESOL learner numbers*
  - 2) to continue to develop ESOL tutor training*
  - 3) to continue to build a partnership ethos through our ESOL Providers group.*
- (M12)

*We applied and were successful in securing ESF funding which will finance a more structured approach to ESOL Learning in the North East of Scotland, mainly. (M13)*

*Additional Staff trained. Additional resources purchased. (M5)*

*The focus on literacies over the last seven years and the new focus on ESOL is helpful. However, we now need to consider how we best support the development of wider community based learning programmes which will also help literacies and ESOL learners progress.(M4)*

The areas that stated they have not made provision for the future added the following remarks;

*Attempt to secure funding from a range of sources. ESOL is very expensive to provide due to childcare costs, relatively slow progress of learners, not enough provision/hours per learner. (M3)*

*The Adult National Strategy for ESOL is a beginning but only by effective co-ordination and partnership working at local authority level will the needs begin to be addressed. (M3)*

Tutor training and relevant teaching materials have emerged as main factors for future progression. These, of course, require funding and some managers have indicated that they have applied for additional funding, some from the European Social Fund (ESF). They have acknowledged that ESOL provision is still developing and are striving to achieve a 'more structured approach to ESOL learning'. (M13)

#### Summary of Managers' responses

The increase in the number of learners requiring assistance with ESOL since 2000 has had a significant impact on a wide geographical area of Scotland. Providers have responded by implementing a training infrastructure for staff, endeavouring to secure funding and working in partnership with other organisations to ensure the needs of these learners were met effectively. However, progress appears to have been slow, with some areas still in the process of developing their ESOL structure, and securing adequate funding to meet the demand remains an issue. The provision of ESOL teaching has proved to be very expensive; new tutors had to be recruited and the hours of existing tutors increased, tutors required training, training officers had to be recruited, additional resources and teaching materials required to be purchased and further premises made available. Whilst the Scottish Government has responded, with various research projects and initiatives, large-scale ESOL in Scotland does seem to be still in a developmental stage.

## 4.2 Tutors' Questionnaire Results

### Response

Twenty-seven tutors responded, (a 25% response rate), and, more importantly, the responses received covered twelve different areas in Scotland, with tutors from nine Local Authorities and three Voluntary Partnership organisations providing information. Whereas the questions put to the managers referred to organisational aspects, the tutor questionnaires were constructed to gain insight into the classroom teaching of ALN and ESOL. The tutors were firstly asked about their professional role and how the increase in learner numbers since 2000 had impacted on their role as a tutor. Areas such as Mixed Classes, Tutor Qualifications, Induction and Training and Materials and Resources were then investigated (Appendix 3).

### Professional Role

Fifteen of the respondents advised that they tutor only ESOL, with three tutoring Adult Literacy and the remaining nine tutoring both. However, seven of those who tutor both indicated that ESOL takes up more of their time with the other two stating Adult Literacy does. These two tutors added the comments;

*I am now seeking a professional qualification in teaching English (CELTA).*

*(Tutor (T) 9)*

*ESOL is an area of my work in which I feel I am inexperienced. I am now taking as much training as I possibly can to upskill myself. (T6)*

These comments indicate that ESOL training is perceived as beneficial for ALN tutors and also show their willingness to assist even though inexperienced.

One ALN tutor, however, commented;

*Not having an ESOL qualification means there are students I cannot work with.*

(T16)

It is unclear from this comment if the tutor has chosen not to teach ESOL (being unqualified) or if it is a management decision.

#### Impact on Tutors due to increase in learner numbers.

When asked if the increase in learner numbers from 2000 had an impact on them as a tutor, twenty-three of the respondents stated 'Yes' and four 'No'. One of these four tutored only literacy with the other three being ESOL tutors. One commented '*I just continued teaching as always*' (T19) and the others did not expand their response.

Most of the comments received from the tutors who advised that the increase had impacted on them indicated that more work was available and employment was provided. Some other comments were;

*The impact has obviously been that I have had increase in numbers of people wishing to learn English. It is almost without exception that learners and potential learners are not so interested in paying for English classes. In some cases, employers actively encourage employees to attend classes. This is so particularly in the rural areas. (T4a)*

*As a sessional tutor the availability of work has increased hugely. Move from Asian to European Learners. (T16)*

*Busier & more diverse classes e.g. citizenship (T18)*

The main impacts, according to these responses, are increased work for existing tutors, employment for others and a more varied role for ESOL tutors. In many ways, these can be seen as positive impacts.

### Mixed Classes

The tutors were then asked if they had experienced any mixed classes and the responses proved very interesting. The tutors were not asked to comment on a specific mixed group of learners, resulting in some commenting on mixed ability classes (both ESOL and ALN), others on classes with both ESOL and ALN learners and some tutors referring to ESOL Literacies only, including references to learners who, perhaps, had literacy problems in their first language. Responses more relevant to this study, however, are mixed classes of ESOL and ALN learners and the main focus will be on those responses.

Eighteen of the tutors had experienced mixed classes, and all of these found it challenging. Only one of these fourteen felt that mixed classes definitely did not have a negative impact on the learners, commenting that;

*The best way to learn is to teach – I often pair a higher & lower level student together, to the benefit of both. (T11)*

One felt that mixed classes ‘possibly’ had an impact on the learners, adding;

*It’s not just the mixed class, mixed abilities. If you have enough time and consistent attendance, it’s possible to try and group the students accordingly and/or have peer teaching. But attendance is usually quite erratic. (T3a)*

Views on having ESOL learners in a class with ALN learners were;

*We don’t mix literacies and ESOL learners as we feel this is inappropriate (T4)*

*I believe they shouldn’t be mixed (T13a)*

*The adult literacy learners did not necessarily have the social skills to feel comfortable about having ESOL learners in the group. They made few, if any, concessions towards modifying their speech and vocabulary easier for ESOL Learners to understand. Also the fact that the ESOL Learners did not have literacy needs in their own language meant that they had unrealistic expectations of the group. They wanted to cover finer aspects of grammar and/or better English. (T1)*

*Generally the impact was positive – another view of learning, diff. cultures, ideas etc. Negative was the intensive tuition required. (T16)*

*Previously I've taught Literacy groups with one or two ESOL Learners. These were ESOL learners with good levels of spoken English so they were able to contribute well to the group discussions. The ESOL learners would probably have made more progress if a dedicated ESOL class at the right level had been available. I don't think the presence of these ESOL learners had any negative impact on the 1<sup>st</sup> language learners. (T11)*

Comments given about ESOL learners with literacy problems included;

*I have had one or two cases over the years where I've suspected that the learner is not literate in his/her own language. This gives a 'Beginner' class a challenge, because they are really pre-beginner! (T19)*

*Very difficult to teach a mixed class if some learners are not literate in their own language, unless just concentration on speaking/listening skills. (T19)*

*I have come across a few 2 or 3 – people who appear to be dyslexic and this creates something of a problem when teaching them English. However, I would not describe this as a mixed ESOL and Adult Literacy class. (T4a)*

I grouped the above comments for ease of reading and also to highlight the very diverse needs of the learners and the subsequent challenges for managers and tutors. Although some tutors had quite a positive view about mixed classes, such as the learners supporting each other, learning by assisting others and also experiencing different cultures, most had a negative view. The comments received about literacy issues were interesting, with the tutors being unsure if the ESOL learners were literate in their own language. The main point that emerged was that mixed classes, with ESOL and ALN learners in the same class, can result in less effective teaching and learning due to lack of learner progress and the demands placed on the tutor in coping with a mixed class.

### Qualification of Tutors

The next part of the questionnaire concentrated on qualifications and the tutors were firstly asked if they felt adequately qualified to teach ESOL learners. Twenty-one advised that they did, although three of these tutors had no ESOL qualification, and another two, who had a TESOL Certificate and an RSA CIT TESLA, seemed a bit unsure, adding '*to a certain degree*' (T3) and '*that's Yes and No*' (T3a). Another, whose qualification was a Trinity TEFL Certificate, added the comment; '*though the 'pre-beginners' require a different set of skills I don't have the training for*' (T19). The six who did not feel adequately qualified comprised of two who tutored both ESOL and Literacy but did not have an ESOL qualification, one who did have an ESOL qualification and three who tutored only adult literacy. A total of nineteen tutors advised that they did hold an ESOL qualification, with some of these being of a very high standard. The following qualifications were named;

TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages), (T3a and T4a)

RSA Cert TESOL (T3)

Trinity TESOL (T18)

MA (Hons) English Language & Linguistics (1973) (T11)

Cert of Sec Educ (English) with TEFL/TESL (Teaching English as a Foreign/Second Language) endorsement (1974) (T11)

RSA Certificate TEFL/TESOL, (T11a)

Trinity College London TESOL, (T13a)

CELTA (Certificate in English Language Teaching to Adults), (T16)

RSA CELTA (T13)

Trinity TEFL (Teaching English as a Foreign Language) Certificate, (T19)

MA CELTA, (T19)

Degree in teaching English as a Foreign Language (T7)

City & Guilds in teaching basic skills (ESOL). (T4)

Diploma in ESOL in Further and Adult Education (T11b)

This information highlights the very varied qualifications of the tutors providing ESOL teaching, ranging from a very high standard to having no ESOL qualification. It is also interesting that three tutors who were qualified to a high standard stated that they did not feel fully confident in teaching ESOL learners in the ALN streams.

### Induction and Training

The provision of in-service ESOL training was the next area to be investigated and only the tutors were asked to comment on this. Thirteen had received some form of induction or training and three advised they had not. Those who did not comment on this were all ESOL qualified, apart from one who tutored only ALN.

From the three who had not received any induction and training, one felt adequately qualified to assist but did not, however, possess an ESOL qualification and coped by;

*Using a combination of textbooks/workbooks etc and my experience as a Primary Teacher. (T7)*

This was an interesting comment as it indicates that this tutor had not received any training in adult teaching and yet felt adequately qualified.

Another was an Adult Literacy and Numeracy tutor who had experienced mixed classes, but made use of volunteers to assist the ESOL learners in the class. The further comment provided here was;

*My degree is in English Language and Literature and I learned a modern language up to 'A' level so I could, to some extent, draw on my academic background. (T1)*

It is unclear, though, if the volunteers who assisted held a qualification. The remaining one was a literacy tutor, again with experience of mixed classes, who advised;

*I have very little contact with ESOL students. Usually in a group situation where one or more of the tutors specialises in that area. (T16)*

Those who had received induction or training for their role, seven of whom held an ESOL qualification, were asked their views on this and provided comments such as;

*1.5 years 'shadowing' existing ESOL Tutor (T9)*

*4 once a week class at Moray House during my post-grad teaching course, plus further training as part of my CDP provided by employer, SATEFL, etc (T11)*

*I was given very basic training by Adult Learning. My TESOL course has proved to be very useful (T13a)*

*I started doing ESOL teaching as a volunteer (before doing a TEFL qualification) & really enjoyed the 8 evening training (T19)*

*In-house induction training. Great starting point but not really enough for continued delivery. (T6)*

On being asked if they would like to comment further on the aspect of training and induction, the tutors provided some very interesting views;

*Training – such as it is - when available is difficult for sessional tutors to access as we would have to cancel classes, losing money and relationship with employer. (T3a)*

*I did receive training but no induction.....well, I chose, myself, to act as a volunteer assistant before beginning to take classes myself. This was because I was inexperienced. (T4a)*

*Had to insist on training as teaching ESOL learners is so very different from Ad Lit (T7)*

*Best is 'on the job', supported by experienced teachers (T11)*

*Have also had a lot of in-service training in adult literacies & some refresher courses in ESOL (T11)*

*Learning strategy – trial & error, peer feedback, pooling of ideas. (T19)*

This section produced some very mixed views on the induction and training provided. Some felt the training was very basic, such as an 'intro to TEFL' (T7), others chose to work as a volunteer to learn from experienced teachers and one commented that it is difficult for sessional tutors to access training. It is evident from the findings here that there is a requirement for an accessible and organised training infrastructure.

### Materials and Resources

In the final section of the questionnaire, tutors were asked if they felt the available resources and teaching/learning materials were relevant and suitable for ESOL Learners. Four stated they were not and when asked how they found appropriate resources, advised;

*I spend a lot of time on researching material – books, magazines, internet and also on collecting, making posters, pictures, cards and all sorts of realia. (T19)*

*I used my own training material initially. After the first term, more material was made available. (I tried the internet but found that finding appropriate material for intelligent and educated adults was almost impossible) My employers are trying to provide more and more material. (T4)*

*Catalogues & on-line but mainly self-created to meet learners' needs (T4)*

*Adapted materials where required (T1)*

One respondent felt the resources were ‘*sometimes*’ relevant and suitable, adding;

*Provision and availability of resources depends on the organisation supplying the tutor. Generally resources are sourced from the organisations that have them & used for those that don't! The internet, colleagues & a bank of personal resources are also vital. (T16)*

Twenty-two tutors viewed the available resources and teaching/learning materials as relevant and suitable but four of them added the comments; ‘*Partly*’ (T3a), ‘*Sure, some are*’ (T3), ‘*But very limited*’ (T4), and

*‘Though there is not much of real complete beginners including those who write in another script or may not be literate in their own languages. There is a lot of good stuff – though I'd like to have more photocopiable material’. (T19)*

Further comments received in this area were plentiful with most indicating that the tutors had to find their own resources or adapt what was available to make them relevant and effective. Other views provided were;

*Some resources designed for adult literacies are useful for beginner ESOL Learners. Useful materials, particularly for listening, are now available on line. Many learners access these from home. (T11)*

*Most ESOL resources are aimed at the formal, certificated suppliers/learners. ‘Survival’ & ‘Basic Living & Working in the UK materials are scarce & generally what my (Non-FE) learners need. (T16)*

*I find very little for adult ESOL learners. Courses are designed for teenager/young adult TEFL learners, which can be inappropriate for migrants & refugees. (T19)*

The main concerns emerging from this section are that there appeared to be a lack of appropriate resources, with tutors endeavouring to find or produce their own and adapting teaching/learning materials designed for ALN learners.

### Further comments

To finish, the respondents were given the opportunity to provide any further comments if they wished to do so. This proved very advantageous to the qualitative nature of the research as the tutors reflected on some areas that were not included in the questionnaire, such as funding and learners' attendance. Some comments were;

*Although the Scottish Parliament has made ESOL Strategy funding available, this can only be accessed by mainstream bodies. Therefore, Community Learning Centres (invaluable in their approach and Ethos) now find it impossible to avail themselves of any ESOL Funding. (T3)*

*The team I work with is intent upon providing quality teaching. The problem can be the fluidity of the students who come and go. Those that have remained for an academic year, and who have attended classes regularly, have definitely benefited. One of the challenges has been to encourage people to attend classes regularly. One way of achieving this is to make the classes stimulating, fun and that cogniscence is taken of the education and intelligence of students. (T4a)*

*Larger numbers presenting for ESOL classes who cannot be accommodated due to lack of funding & resources (T3)*

*I am learning all the time and I am always searching for ideas to encourage and stimulate so that visitors to Scotland will learn about us and our language, in order that they can become part of the community. (T4)*

The following comment was provided by a trained and experienced tutor:

*From experience I think ESOL courses should be time limited in order to cope better with the demand. I believe a 20 week period is adequate for beginners and I do question up to what level we cater for. (T13a)*

These comments indicate a lack of funding and resources, attendance of ESOL learners at classes can be irregular, it may be better to have classes running for a set amount of weeks to cope with the demand and one tutor questioned up to what level we should cater for.

### Summary of Tutors' responses

The majority of the tutors who responded advised that the increase in learner numbers in Scotland since 2000 had impacted on their role as a tutor. The main impact was of a positive nature, providing employment for qualified ESOL tutors, increasing the hours of existing ESOL and Adult Literacy staff and offering a more varied teaching role. Comments received, such as a '*Move from Asian to European Learner*' (T16) and '*Busier & more diverse classes e.g. citizenship*' (T18) highlight the demographic change that Scotland has experienced since 2000.

The views on mixed classes, having ESOL and ALN learners in the same class, were, however, more negative. Most found this challenging and felt it could result in less effective teaching and learning. Comments were given about mixed ability classes, mixing ALN learners with ESOL learners and dealing with ESOL learners who may have literacy needs in their mother tongue. One view, '*The ESOL learners would probably have made more progress if a dedicated ESOL class at the right level had been available*' (T11), highlights the need for increased provision. Research carried out in 2007 highlights that '*where there is less provision, more courses are for mixed levels of ability or only for those with the lowest levels of ability in English*' (Scottish Executive, 2007b:71).

The findings from this questionnaire also pointed out the very varied level of qualifications held by ESOL tutors. It was interesting to find that even some of those highly qualified did not feel fully confident in teaching ESOL learners included in our ALN streams. There were also mixed

views on the induction and training available for tutors, with some feeling it was too basic, others commented it was difficult for sessional tutors to access training and some preferred to ‘*shadow*’ (T9) another ESOL tutor and assist as a volunteer. Highlighted here was the requirement for accessible training, an organised training infrastructure and an appropriate qualification.

Considering our learner numbers have been increasing since 2000, there still appears to be a lack of appropriate teaching materials and resources, with tutors spending a lot of time searching for or producing their own material as well as adapting resources designed for the adult literacy classroom.

The respondents made full use of the space provided at the end of the questionnaire to voice other views they had. Comments were received on some areas that had not been included in the questionnaire, such as a lack of funding, irregular attendance of ESOL learners at classes, how it can be more difficult to recruit ALN learners, that it may be better to have classes running for a set amount of weeks to cope with the demand and one tutor questioned up to what level we should cater for. These are all relevant and important issues and worth further investigation.

I have provided only some of the tutors’ comments in this paper. There were too many to list, with some also being quite similar, and I have endeavoured to cover all the main aspects and issues derived from them. The findings from both the managers’ and tutors’ responses will be discussed further in the next section.

## **Chapter Five**

### **Discussion**

This study was performed to investigate the impact that the growing demand for publicly funded ESOL provision has had on the field of Adult Literacy and Numeracy (ALN) education in Scotland. Since the Scottish Executive began to fund ESOL provision in 2001 (Scottish Executive, 2005b:2), Scotland has experienced a considerable demographic change, with an increasing number of learners requiring assistance with English skills. This had an impact on me, personally, as a tutor for both ESOL and ALN and, through observation and some discussion with colleagues, it evidently had an impact on them also. This was the main impetus for my research project. I felt it would be very worthwhile and informative for future practice in the field of ALN and ESOL to research the impact it was having on providers and tutors in various areas of Scotland. Although no universal conclusion can be drawn from the findings, due to the small scale of the research, it has highlighted areas of concern and provided professional views on potential improvements, with the tutors and managers making full use of the space provided in the questionnaire for further comments.

#### The impact from the increase in learner numbers.

All nine managers who responded reported the increase in ESOL learner numbers had a significant impact on provision and practice in their areas, with three stating a very significant impact. Findings showed, however, that providers did not have an adequate amount of trained teaching staff in place to cope with the increased demand. They began to recruit, increased the hours of existing staff and organised training for new and existing staff. One area, which experienced a very large increase in learner numbers from 2000 onwards, has not remedied this situation and still does not have an adequate amount of teaching staff to cope with the demand. All but four of the tutors commented that the increased demand for ESOL provision had an impact on them, creating employment and an increase in working hours, as well as a more varied teaching role. Whilst this

does indicate that the existing infrastructure was not prepared for the increased demand, creating challenges and additional workload for the managers, the impact on the tutors can be viewed in a more positive way as far as working hours are concerned.

Although my findings cannot indicate the increased demand for ESOL provision affected the whole of Scotland, it does reflect the findings from previous research carried out in 2007, which showed that the demand from the European Union Accession States (A8) since 2004 has been significant in nearly all areas of Scotland.

#### Impact on Programme Management

Despite the increasing number of learners, however, only four of the areas currently have ESOL learners on waiting lists, with one of these areas also having adult literacy learners awaiting assistance. With previous research showing that ESOL demand outweighs supply, resulting in waiting lists in many areas, most of the providers in this study have evidently endeavoured to ensure that provision is in place for both the ESOL and ALN learners who are seeking assistance. One manager did provide the view, though, that ESOL learners in the community are more likely to come forward to ask for help, whereas ALN learners need encouragement and do not come forward so readily.

On the topic of recruitment, a comment was provided by a manager on the large amount of ESOL qualified people that were in the community and who came forward in response to an advertisement, many of whom had achieved qualifications in order to travel. The qualifications held were also varied in standard. The findings highlighted that some tutors, although highly qualified to teach ESOL, required further training to feel fully confident about providing an effective service to the ESOL learners in the ALN streams, not having any experience of literacy

teaching or workplace literacies. This is in line with the managers commenting that they organised training for new and existing staff. Only one tutor, however, out of the fifteen ESOL tutors who held a qualification, did not feel adequately qualified to teach. My findings here are in contrast to those from a study carried out in Scotland in 2005, which showed that those previously trained and experienced in teaching EFL in this country and abroad, did not feel adequately qualified to teach ESOL (Scottish Executive, 2005b:71). My study indicates that most did feel adequately qualified but required further training for the context in which they were working, teaching ESOL in the ALN streams. This does, though, highlight one of the differences between teaching ESOL, aimed at providing English skills for '*daily activities at home, at work and in the community*' (Ivanicv et al, 2006) and EFL. It also emerged from my findings that some tutored both ALN and ESOL, although not all of the tutors who were delivering ESOL were qualified. Five held no qualification and, interestingly, three of them felt that they were adequately qualified to teach ESOL learners.

This part of the study highlights the very varied qualifications of the tutors delivering ESOL in Scotland, with some not being qualified at all. It also indicates the need for training in adult literacies for those with experience in ESOL teaching, as well as ESOL training for the ALN tutors who have come forward to assist with the increased demand for ESOL teaching. This would greatly enhance provision both for providers and learners.

It is evident from the findings that a more structured, accessible and relevant training infrastructure is required. The views and comments about training received from both managers and tutors were very varied and the managers did appear to be organising their own training programmes. In one area, a designated ESOL training officer had been designing a two day induction course for prospective ESOL tutors and holding sessions on specific topics. Another

manager advised of ten introductory ESOL courses this past year, monthly workshops and some tutors had been supported to participate in the CELTA (Certificate in English Language Teaching to Adults) course. However, less than half of the tutors who responded had received some form of induction and training and some of those who did felt their training was very basic or difficult to access for sessional tutors. Others chose to work with experienced teachers as volunteers to learn from them. This highlights the commitment and dedication of our tutors, taking responsibility for their own professional development in order to provide a more effective service. One major concern that emerged from the study was that none of the participants, managers or tutors, mentioned the Professional Development Award: *Teaching Adult ESOL Literacies*, accredited in April 2005 by the SQA (Scottish Executive, 2007a:12) and aimed at enhancing literacy training for ESOL teachers. Availability of and access to the training course for this qualification would be beneficial for all. Managers would not need to spend time organising training courses, tutors would benefit from a structured, universal course of learning and would then all have the same qualification, and the learners would be taught by more qualified and confident tutors. The Glasgow ESOL Forum also suggested a need to develop a qualification in ESOL methodology for adult literacy tutors, building on their expertise (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:10), and, as previously mentioned, this would be greatly advantageous for those literacy tutors who also teach ESOL. The amended definition of ESOL learners adopted, “*Someone who may or may not be literate in his/her own mother-tongue and who has little or no literacy in English; whose spoken English may range from basic to fluent*” (Glasgow ESOL Forum, 2003:5), highlights the benefits of teaching expertise in both ESOL and ALN. It is very evident, thus, that ESOL learners, managers and tutors would benefit greatly from the training and knowledge provided by these qualifications.

## Impact on Teaching and Learning

### Teaching and learning materials

Adequate and relevant teaching materials were also in short supply according to most of the managers and tutors, with a particular lack of materials aimed at integration, work preparation and for complete beginners. This is in spite of the Scottish Refugee Integration Forum (SRIF) stressing urgency for action to be taken prior to the agreement of a national strategy in order to allow ESOL learners to integrate into society as quickly as possible (Scottish Executive, 2003b:20). It again highlights gaps in the provision where providers were left to cope with demand and improvise. Most respondents commented that they improvised by designing and making their own or adapting materials designed for adult literacy learners. However, as well as demanding time and effort, the suitability and quality of these produced materials may be questionable, due to the lack of ESOL training provided beforehand. Funding is, of course, necessary to purchase materials and those managers who had available funds, were able to purchase relevant materials for ESOL learners.

### Mixed Classes

Although mentioned previously that most areas did not currently have ESOL learners on waiting lists, comments received from tutors, however, highlight that not all learners are placed in classes according to their individual needs. Only the tutors were asked to comment on mixed classes of learners, and professional views were received on coping with a variety of mixed classes. Fourteen of the respondents had experienced some form of mixed class and all found it challenging, with

only one feeling it did not impact on the learners and another suggesting it '*possibly*' had an impact. Although some commented on coping with mixed ability classes and the demands this placed on tutors, the main concern, and also more relevant for this research, was having ESOL and ALN learners in the same class. The most popular view was that they should not be mixed. It was generally felt that mixing was not only demanding for the tutor, but resulted in inappropriate and less effective teaching and learning. Roberts et al argued, as discussed earlier in the paper, that the method of ESOL teaching and learning differs from the ALN classroom (2004:7).

Previous discussion on teaching and learning materials and tutor training also clearly show there are differences. With the ESOL learners requiring conversational skills, talk is work in the ESOL classroom, and the most important mode of learning for ESOL learners is through group interaction and opportunities to practice speaking and listening. Communication problems were highlighted by tutors, whereas the ESOL learners may not fully understand the ALN learners if they did not modify their speech and vocabulary. Another view was that, whilst being in the same group did not have any negative effect on the ALN learner, the ESOL learners would benefit more from a dedicated ESOL class. On the other hand, though, mixing ESOL and ALN learners could have positive aspects. One comment was that it provides an opportunity to learn different cultures and ideas, albeit intensive tuition is required.

Although some tutors had quite a positive view about mixed classes, such as the learners supporting each other, learning by assisting others and also experiencing different cultures, most had a negative view, mainly due to the challenges and demands placed on tutors, resulting in less effective provision.

### Potential Improvements

All but two areas have made future plans, which include more tutor training, recruitment of additional staff, increasing hours of existing staff, providing teaching materials and continuing to increase learner numbers. All this, of course, requires funding and one very relevant view was; *'We are directly driven by funding sources. We cannot project forward when finance is unknown'*. Whilst all the managers did report that they had received government funding, all, apart from two, felt the funding was inadequate for the growing demand of ESOL, and there remains some concern amongst ESOL practitioners that ALN partnership funding cannot always provide appropriate tuition for ESOL learners due to their wider range of needs. With some of the tutors also commenting negatively on funding aspects, funding did emerge as a major concern for future developments and improvements.

Although the Government has increased funding over the last few years, the need for further funding has been acknowledged with the Scottish Government recently announcing a further £9 million of funding for English language classes (Scottish Executive News Release, 2008). Hopefully, providers will be able to make use of this to address the many issues that have emerged from this study.

This discussion has highlighted the many challenges faced by both managers and tutors in coping with the increase in learners requiring English skills. It has also confirmed the Government's acknowledgement that the initial refugee dispersal programme had not catered for the large numbers arriving and adult education providers were left to improvise (Scottish Executive, 2005b:31). Findings have indicated that they are still improvising and striving to ensure that some kind of provision is in place for those learners who require it.

## **Chapter Six**

### **Conclusion**

My study has discussed the changing demographics of Scotland since 2000 and the subsequent increasing requirement for ESOL provision. As part of the Scottish Executive's initiative in promoting Adult Literacy, Numeracy and ESOL, classes for ESOL and ESOL literacies were set up within ALN partnerships and funding made available from 2001, but findings in this paper have indicated that improvements are necessary in many areas to professionalise the practice and providers are still improvising.

Positive aspects emerging are an increase in working hours for tutors, a more varied role and employment for some. Inclusion of ESOL in ALN provision also has a positive impact for the learners, with classes available and provided by very dedicated and supportive staff who have shown willingness to improvise and endeavour to provide an effective service. Teaching staff, however, would benefit from a more universal training infrastructure with a recognised qualification emerging from it.

Whilst one of the principles of the Adult ESOL Strategy in Scotland is to provide provision which contributes to wider national literacy targets, there have been concerns raised about the appropriateness of placing ESOL in the ALN streams. There was debate over the wording of the definition for ESOL literacy learners, and the amended definition widened the access to provision, increasing the numbers and range of English and literacy skills. ESOL's position and legitimacy in the ALN agenda will be addressed in the forthcoming 'refresh' of the ALNIS strategy.

My findings also indicated that, whilst having ESOL and ALN learners in the same group can have many positive impacts on the learners, most felt it resulted in less effective teaching and learning, with the main view being it proved very demanding for the tutor. This may be due to the lack of literacy or ESOL training on the part of the tutor, however, and expertise in both areas would increase the tutors' confidence. Our ESOL learners require both conversation and literacies assistance and, with conversation skills being a major element of ESOL teaching and learning, it may be worth considering having dedicated ESOL classes to begin with. The learners would benefit from the expertise of our trained ESOL tutors, improving their communication skills to then join a class of adult literacy learners to improve their reading and writing skills. Although my small scale study is not reaching any firm conclusion in this area, this suggestion could also be viewed as assisting with the demands placed on providers to organise literacy training for their

ESOL trained staff. It could also be viewed as meeting with a guiding principle of the Adult ESOL Strategy, in organising provision which is high quality, easily accessible, cost-effective and uses best practice in the teaching and learning of languages (Scottish Executive: 2007) .

There is also a clear need for available and suitable teaching materials. Providers have been improvising by producing their own, adapting ALN materials and searching for suitable materials for their learners. The quality of these resources may be questionable, however, due to the lack of training on the part of the tutors. A resource base, with a range of materials to suit various abilities and differing topics, and which could be accessed by both providers and tutors, would be very advantageous. It would free up time that could be put to use in the classroom, and the learners would benefit from more professional teaching materials.

It has proved to be expensive, with the number of learners increasing and a wider range of skills being addresses, and funding emerged as a major issue with providers. The Government has responded to this, though, with additional funding now being made available and this will be welcomed by our providers.

I mentioned previously that the qualitative nature of the study allowed other relevant themes to emerge. Areas that may have implications for future practice, and may be worthy of future research, include a decrease in learner numbers in some areas, the irregularity of attendance by ESOL learners and up to what level of English competence should be taught in the ALN and ESOL classes. These issues could be viewed as having implications on areas such as funding, training and the recruitment of staff.

While it is quite a concern that many areas in the ESOL teaching and learning environment are still in need of improvement and further development, the increased demand for ESOL provision does not appear to have had a negative effect on ALN provision and practice, with the

findings indicating that most learners currently awaiting tuition are ESOL learners. Also, although extensive research has been performed surrounding the field of ESOL, work is still being done to fulfil the Scottish Executive's commitment to monitoring, reviewing and adjusting our excellent ALNIS strategy. I am very confident that, with the continued dedication and commitment of our adult education providers, and the Scottish Government's commitment to the Adult Literacy, Numeracy and ESOL strategy, Scotland will eventually be congratulated on its provision of both ESOL and ALN practices and provision.

I do hope that this research project has fulfilled its aim of being informative and beneficial for future practices in the field of ALN and ESOL.

## References:

Bell, J. (2007) *Doing your research project: A guide for first time researchers in education, health and social science* 4<sup>th</sup> edition Open University Press: Maidenhead

Borg, W.R. and Gall, M.D. (1989) *Educational Research. An Introduction* Fifth Edition Longman Inc: New York

British Council BBC (2008) *Teaching English*

(Online)

Accessed 5<sup>th</sup> July, 2008

Available from: <http://www.teachingenglish.org.uk/think/knowledge-wiki/efl>

COSLA Strategic Migration Partnership (2007) *Immigration to the UK & Scotland*

(Online)

Accessed 3rd February, 2008 Available

from: <http://www.asylumscotland.org.uk/ukimmigration.php>

Cresswell, J.W. (2003) *Research Design. Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* Second Edition Sage Publications Inc: California

Dornyei, Z (2007) *Research Methods in Applied Linguistics* Oxford University Press: London

Glasgow Council for the Voluntary Sector (GCVS) (2005) *An Adult ESOL Strategy for Scotland: Response from the Glasgow Council for the Voluntary Sector*

(Online)

Accessed 4th February & 14th March, 2008

Available from: [http://www.gcv.org.uk/consultation/consultation\\_responses](http://www.gcv.org.uk/consultation/consultation_responses)

Glasgow ESOL Forum (2003) *National Consultation Document: PDA: Teaching Adult ESOL Literacies*

(Online)

Accessed 22nd March, 2008

Available from: <http://www.glasgowesol.co.uk/>

Ivanovo, R, Appleby, Y, Hodge, R, Testing, K and Barton, D (2006) [linking learning and everyday life: a social perspective on adult language, literacy and numeracy classes](#)

(Online)

Accessed 3<sup>rd</sup> February, 2008

Available from:

[http://www.nrdc.org.uk/projects\\_details.asp?ProjectID=14&ProjectCategoryID=2](http://www.nrdc.org.uk/projects_details.asp?ProjectID=14&ProjectCategoryID=2)

Leavey, J. (2007) *“Improving Teaching and Learning for Adults with Basic Skill Needs through Formative Assessment”* OECD Study Learning Connections Communities Scotland: Edinburgh

Merrifield, J. (2005) *Why England should look North for inspiration* REFLECT Online Magazine Issue No. 4 P 20

(Online)

Accessed 8<sup>th</sup> March, 2008

Available from: <http://www.nrdc.org.uk/content.asp?CategoryID=917&ArticleID=761> National Research and Development Centre for Adult Literacy and Numeracy website

Roberts, C., Baynham, M., Shrubshall, P., Barton, D., Chopra, P., Cooke, M., Hodge, R., Pitt, K., Schellekens, P., Wallace, C. & Whitfield, S. (2004). *English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) - case studies of provision, learners' needs and resources*. London: NRDC.

(Online)

Accessed 16<sup>th</sup> March, 2008

Available from: [www.nrdc.org.uk](http://www.nrdc.org.uk)

Scottish Executive (2001) *Adult Literacy and Numeracy in Scotland*

(Online)

Accessed 20<sup>th</sup> February, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/158952/0043191.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2003b) *Scottish Refugee Integration Forum: Action Plan*

(Online)

Accessed 3<sup>rd</sup> February, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scottishexecutive.gov.uk/Publications/2003/02/16364/18142> and <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/47032/0027032.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2004) *Report on the Scottish Adult Literacy and Numeracy Strategy 2001 – 2004*

(Online)

Accessed 24<sup>th</sup> February, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/1046/0053515.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2005a) National *‘English for speakers of others languages’ (ESOL) Strategy: Mapping Exercise and Scoping Study-Research Findings*

(Online)

Accessed 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 23<sup>rd</sup> March, 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2005/01/20538/50194> (Scottish Government Research) and <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/35596/0029540.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2005b) National '*English for speakers of others languages*' (ESOL) Strategy: *Mapping Exercise and Scoping Study*

(Online)

Accessed 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2005/01/20537/50169> (Scottish Government Research) and <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/35596/0026951.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2006) *A Consultation on an Adult ESOL Strategy for Scotland:*

*Analysis of Responses*

(Online)

Accessed 14<sup>th</sup> March, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/115477/0028630.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2006b) *Research on Adult Literacy and Numeracy in Scotland*

*EVIDENCE REPORT FOR ALNIS 'REFRESH'*

Enterprise, Transport and Lifelong

Learning Department: Edinburgh

(Online)

Accessed 3<sup>rd</sup> April, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/1046/0044987.pdf> and <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/1046/0044987.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2007) *Report on the Scottish Adult Literacy and Numeracy Strategy 2006/2007*

(Online)

Accessed 22<sup>nd</sup> February, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/197354/0052792.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2007a) *The Adult ESOL Strategy for Scotland*

(Online)

Accessed 5<sup>th</sup> February & 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/176977/0050036.pdf>

Scottish Executive (2007b) *Examining the Impact of EU Enlargement and the Introduction of the UK Citizenship Test on Provision of English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) in Scotland*

(Online)

Accessed 3<sup>rd</sup> February & 21<sup>st</sup> March, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2007/11/09142837/0> The Scottish Government Publications and <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/202773/0054072.pdf>

Scottish Executive: News Release (2004) *First Minister's statement on Fresh Talent*

(Online)

Accessed 16<sup>th</sup> March and 12<sup>th</sup> July, 2008

Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/News/News-Extras/191> and

<http://www.gla.ac.uk/icgws/docs/Fresh%20Talent%20News%20Release.doc>

Scottish Executive: News Release (Feb: 2008) *£9 million for English language training*  
(Online) Accessed 6<sup>th</sup> February, 2008  
Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/News/Releases/2008/02/04092430> The Scottish  
Government News

Tett, L., Hall, S., MacLauchlan, K. Thorpe, G., Edwards, V., and Garside, L. (2006) *Evaluation of  
the Scottish Adult Literacy and Numeracy Initiative* Scottish Executive Social Research  
(Online) Accessed 23rd February, 2008  
Available from: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/97002/0023575.pdf>

### **Appendix 3**

Questionnaire for Tutors in the field of Adult Literacy, Numeracy and English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL).

Research Project:

**‘Adult Literacy, Numeracy and ESOL: What impact has the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacies?’**

I would like to ask you for your assistance with a research project I am undertaking as part of my Masters studies at the University of Glasgow. I am investigating the impact that the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL has had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacy and Numeracy. My research is focussing on the growth of ESOL demand in Scotland since 2000, which is when the number of adult learners requiring support with English began to increase. Your experience and views in this area would greatly enrich my investigations, and I would be very grateful if you could complete the attached questionnaire, adding any further comments you feel are relevant. The contents of this form are absolutely confidential and any information identifying the respondents will not be disclosed under any circumstances. The questionnaire has been divided into four parts.

On completion, please return to:

Mrs Eleanor Galloway

A stamped addressed envelope is attached for this purpose and may I please request that the questionnaires are returned by 31<sup>st</sup> May, 2008.

Thank you for your co-operation.

Please turn over page

Part 1

**Professional Role**

(Please tick relevant box)

1) Do you tutor

Adult Literacy & Numeracy

ESOL

Or Both?

2) If you assist with both Literacy and ESOL skills, which one demands more of your time?

Literacy

ESOL

3) Has the increase in learners requiring support with English had any impact on you as a Tutor?

Yes

No

If Yes, can you say please explain?

Please turn over page

Part 2

**Classroom**

4) Have you experienced any mixed classes, e.g ESOL and Adult Literacy learners in the same group, mixed abilities etc?

Yes

No

If Yes,

a) did you find this challenging? Yes

No

b) did this have any impact on the learners? Yes

No

Can you provide any further comments on mixed classes?

Please turn over page

Part 3

**Qualification**

5) Did you, as a Tutor, feel adequately qualified to assist these ESOL learners with English skills?

Yes

No

6) Are you a qualified ESOL tutor ?

Yes  (please state qualification) .....

No  If No, then please go to question 6(a)

6(a) Did you receive induction and training?

Yes  Can you comment on the training you received?

No  How did you cope, then, with the challenge?

Please add any further comments regarding training:

**Teaching Materials**

7) Were the available resources and teaching/learning materials relevant and suitable for ESOL Learners?

Yes

No

If No, then how did you find appropriate resources?

Can you provide any further comments on resources and learning materials?

Please turn over page

**Additional Space for any further comments you wish to make**

-----

Please send completed questionnaires in the envelope provided to:

Mrs Eleanor Galloway

Thank you for your co-operation in my research project.

## **Appendix 4**

Questionnaire for Managers/Tutor Organisers in the field of Adult Literacy, Numeracy and English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL).

Research Project:

**‘Adult Literacy, Numeracy and ESOL: What impact has the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacy and Numeracy education in Scotland?’**

I would like to ask you for your assistance with a research project I am undertaking as part of my Masters studies at the University of Glasgow. I am investigating the impact that the incorporation and inclusion of ESOL has had on the provision and practice of Adult Literacy and Numeracy. My research is focussing on the growth of ESOL demand in Scotland since 2000, which is when the number of adult learners requiring support with English began to increase. Your experience and views in this area would greatly enrich my investigations, and I would be very grateful if you could complete the attached questionnaire, adding any further comments you feel are relevant. The contents of this form are absolutely confidential and any information identifying the respondents will not be disclosed under any circumstances. The questionnaire has been divided into five parts.

On completion, please return to:

Mrs Eleanor Galloway

A stamped addressed envelope is attached for this purpose and may I please request that the questionnaires are returned by 31<sup>st</sup> May, 2008.

Thank you for your co-operation.

Please turn over page

Part 1

**Learners**

1) Has the influx of migrants since 2000 had an impact on learner numbers in your area?

Yes

No

If Yes, then how significant has this impact been? (Please circle)

**Low**

**Moderate**

**Significant**

**Very significant**

2) Do you currently have learners on waiting lists?

Yes

No

If Yes, what are the main needs of these learners ? (Please circle)

**Literacy**

**Numeracy**

**ESOL/ESOL Literacies**

3) Overall, what do the majority of your adult learners require assistance with?  
(Please circle)

**Literacy**

**Numeracy**

**ESOL/ESOL Literacies**

Please add any further comments you may have regarding learner numbers in your area:

Please turn over page

Part 2

**Teaching Staff**

4) Did you have an adequate amount of teaching staff to cope with the increased demand for ESOL?

Yes

No  If No, please proceed to b) below \*

a) If Yes, were your Tutors adequately qualified to assist these migrants with English skills?

Yes

No  If No, did they receive induction and training? Yes

No

What are your views on this training if any?

b) If No, then how was this approached and remedied? (Please circle) \*

Recruitment

Increase of hours for existing staff

Mixed Classes

Other (please clarify).....

Please add any further comments you may have regarding the training and qualification of ESOL/ESOL Literacies tutors:

Please turn over page

Part 3

**Learning and Teaching Materials**

5) Did you have adequate teaching/learning materials to cope with the demand?

Yes

No  If No, then how was this remedied?

6) Were the available resources suitable for ESOL teaching and learning?

Yes

No  If No, then how was this remedied?

Can you provide any further comments on resources and learning materials?

Please turn over page

Part 4

**Funding**

7) As far as funding is concerned, the Scottish Government has made funds available for both Adult

Literacy & Numeracy and ESOL. Did your organisation benefit from this funding?

Yes  No

8) Did you feel the funding you received for Literacy & Numeracy was adequate?

Yes  No

9) Did you feel the funding you received for ESOL was adequate for the growing demand?

Yes  No

Please add any further comments you may have on funding

Please turn over page

Part 5

**Future Provision**

10) With learner numbers expected to continue increasing, have you made provision for this?

Yes

No

If Yes, can you say in what way you have made preparations?

If No, then how will you deal with this?

Please add any further comments regarding future provision if you wish:

Please turn over page

**Additional space for any further comments you feel you would like to add.**



-----  
Please send completed questionnaires in the envelope provided by 31<sup>st</sup> May, 2008 to:

Mrs Eleanor Galloway

Thank you for your co-operation in my research project.



